

**San Francisco Estuary Partnership  
Implementation Committee Meeting**

November 18, 2014

Elihu M. Harris State Building

Oakland, California

**DRAFT MEETING SUMMARY**

**Welcome and Introductions:** Amy Hutzal, Chair of the Implementation Committee, called the meeting to order at 9:35 am with a round of introductions.

**Member of the Public and Other Attendees:**

Mia Castro – CORO Fellow

Warner Chabot, new director of SFEI

**Public Comment:** None

**Director's Report:** Judy reviewed the proposed dates for the IC meetings in 2015: Tuesday, March 3<sup>rd</sup>, Wednesday, May 27<sup>th</sup>, Wednesday, August 26<sup>th</sup>, and Tuesday, November 17<sup>th</sup>. As noted previously, those dates are a mix of Tuesdays along with the traditional Wednesday meeting times, all in the standard time slot of 9:30-12:30. There were no concerns, and those dates were approved by the group.

Judy noted that SFEP is managing almost \$50 million in projects for IRWMP (30 projects, plus 7 new ones), in an effort led by Jennifer Krebs. Arthur Feinstein asked what do we do to manage the projects and staff responded that we negotiate contracts, manage reporting and invoicing, and make sure funds are expended appropriately. Melody Tovar commended the staff saying they played a key role in managing all of the groups to put together a coordinated successful proposal. State Coastal Conservancy headed the project selection effort and Jennifer worked with a consultant to pull the final package together.

Karen reported on the Bay-Delta Science Conference's final numbers: 1100 participants, 250 speakers and 175 posters. Abstracts are posted on-line and presentations will be posted soon. She reminded the Committee about the planning schedule for the next State of the San Francisco Estuary Conference (September 17-18, 2015) and asked for input on plenary speakers now and concurrent sessions by March.

Judy reported on the Friends of the San Francisco Estuary conference, Bay+Delta+Water: Better Together. George Miller was the keynote speaker. It was well attended by many elected officials. A report of the conference proceedings is now available on the Friends website, <http://friendsofsfestuary.weebly.com/conference-report.html>. Friends has been working with cities, counties, and water districts around the Bay region on resolutions supporting freshwater flows into the estuary.

**Action Items:**

John Andrew noted a correction to the previous meeting's minutes: his name should be added to the attendees list. Arthur Feinstein moved to approve the August minutes, Harry Seraydarian seconded, and all approved.

Arthur Feinstein moved to accept the 2015 IC Meeting schedule, Barbara Salzman seconded, and all approved.

**State Revolving Fund new project:**

Judy noted that we are close to getting the final paperwork for State Revolving funds to SFEP for 3 components:

- 1) An update of the 2008 State of Bay-Delta Science report. Delta Science strives to use the best available science for the implementation of the Delta Plan, including enforceable actions. The State of the Science needs to be updated on a 4 year cycle but has not been updated since 2008. Working to integrate the timing and products with the other 2 phases.
- 2) State of the Estuary Report – updating the 2011 State of the Bay Report.
- 3) CCMP update - \$260,000 (\$30,000 for project management, content development \$125,000, expert review \$20,000, public review/comment \$20,000, and a few other categories).

**Regarding CCMP Revision:**

- Public Outreach will include an array of activities from brown bag briefings, web site information, and spring outreach workshops.
- Current topic Area Subcommittees include: Water, Habitats, and Living Resources. The other topic areas don't have committees yet (ecological resources and stewardship). A web site for the subcommittee members (no public link, but the link can be requested) is now available to share information and to manage the 5 currently scheduled meetings for each of the 3 areas.
  - Meeting 1 focused on defining the process and drafting the working goals based on a 35 year vision. Other categories are objectives and actions (actions will be based on a 5 year timeline). The Habitat and Living Resources groups came up with working goals. The Water group wanted to wait to develop the goal.
  - Meeting 2 will focus on developing objectives. Staff has been consulting existing resources (i.e. CCMP, regional policy documents and action plans, 2015 State of the Estuary Report, and other resources). We are emphasizing known drivers of change: climate change and population growth as a key part of the effort.

**CCMP Input from IC members:**

Staff asked for feedback on what potential action items are “game changers.” Early ideas included completing the Water Trail and Bay Trail, better connecting baylands with uplands, and water reuse.

Barbara Salzman suggested there are opportunities in dealing with climate change, instead of hardscape and hoped we don't lose track of long term problems (i.e. endangered species). Josh Collins focused on infrastructure change saying we should do our best to marry large-scale restoration planning with large scale infrastructure change (i.e. railroads and other infrastructure)

Carol Mahoney reminded the group that the local RCDs have great programs with ranchers. Arthur Feinstein stated that climate change is going to be difficult and related an example about development plans for the Oakland Coliseum area that did not take into account its location next to San Leandro Marsh and expert opinions that the area will be underwater in 75-100 years.

Kate Poole suggested we look at adopting the state policy on water supply. Warner Chabot noted that BCDC is going to have to go through a paradigm shift on bay fill. He considers that we will need horizontal levees, and BCDC will need to tackle with how and where we are going to fill the bay to provide multiple benefits. He suggested that we should be ambitious in looking at what goals are already in the existing goals reports that can be accomplished in a 5 year period. (Goals are currently at 50 year time schedule).

Amy Hutzel suggested looking at ABAG's Plan Bay Area and its approach to focusing development in selected areas. There will be population increases, but how do we accommodate those with the least impact? Carol Mahoney suggested spurring friendly rivalry among neighboring municipalities with the question, What can your city do to help the bay? Cities in her district take this approach and it works well.

The group was asked to keep in mind:

- Where can the CCMP be innovative and push the envelope?
- What are the priorities for the next 5 years?

#### **Approvals for the CCMP revision:**

The Committee discussed whose approval is needed to ratify or adopt the CCMP revision. EPA is developing formal guidance on getting CCMPs approved, but it's not yet available. It was noted that the current governor is from Oakland, and future potential governors are from the Bay Area, so it would be good to get a sense of ownership from the governor if we can. Judy reminded the members they should contact Caitlin to participate in a subcommittee, or could just review and give comments if you can't be a full participant.

Blake Roberts wondered about the two other topic areas which do not have workgroups currently (Ecological Processes and Stewardship). Judy explained that Stewardship concept includes completion of Bay Trail as a measure, amount of reuse of recycled water, etc., and that we are defining stewardship not a regulatory review but as an expression of the general population's relationship with the bay and environment.

Warner suggested we begin to bring the business community into these discussions.

#### **BREAK**

#### **Highlighting IC Partner Efforts**

#### **Results of Proposition 1 Elections**

Amy Hutzel gave an update on Prop 1. It includes funding for the following: State Coastal Conservancy (SCC), \$250 Million for Department of Fish and Wildlife (DFW) for non-delta watershed restoration, \$87 million for delta restoration, \$50 million for the Delta Conservancy, and \$65 million for IRWMP for the Bay (increased match requirement). The first appropriation will occur in July. The Conservancy portion calls for competitive grants. There is also \$2.7 Billion to the California Water Commission for storage including groundwater. Arthur Feinstein suggested we add the Commission to the IC. Kate Poole noted that the Stanford Woods Institute for the Environment just posted some information about this on their web site. Tom wondered what we can do to access groundwater-related funding available in this region.

Carol Mahoney suggested that the region has some small groundwater basins that would need some remediation before they can be used but might be able to tap into the storage money even though it would be a challenge. The Coastal Conservancy and California Fish and Wildlife are mandated to create criteria for these expenditures. Also, the Wildlife Conservation Board got \$200 million to enhance instream flow.

#### **Estuary News Magazine - Ariel Rubissow Okamoto:**

Ariel reminded the Committee that the publication is now called a magazine. We have gotten good feedback for the decision to remain in print rather than going to online-only distribution and that the publication is in fact targeting to the correct audience. We added some pages and have been making it more substantial, for example with special inserts such as the recent Seasons of Bay Life centerfold poster. Ariel has been taking the print copies to creek meetings and other venues. She is also posting extended stories online. For example, the recent Alameda Creek story was expanded on the web site. The salt field story on the web was timely and came out at the top of the drought discussion. The current distribution is 1700 snail mail, 600 PDF, 500 bulk, in addition to web links. Most recent online traffic metrics show 10,214 web site visits with 7000 new visitors to the Estuary section of the SFEP website. The budget was \$70K for 2014 but the preferred budget for 2015 would be \$95K to accomplish everything she would like to enhance.

Tom Mumley reminded the Committee that getting substantial non-SFEP funding was an experiment to see if outside contributors can keep the publication alive. We should ask if it is still a go (probably yes), then how far can we reach. Ariel asked what we can do to make it a platform to get information and reminded the Committee that it takes money to plan. She said we have a small list, but it is very high quality. We are on a two year commitment with the big funders and noted the publication is not for the general public, it is more of a professional magazine. Without Estuary News, there is no equivalent. There is expansion ability and some of the council members are encouraging adding more key members in the delta community and including professional associations that aren't plugged in yet. The next editorial board meeting is at the end of the year.

#### **State of the Estuary Report – Letitia Grenier:**

The last State of the Bay report came out in 2011. This is an update and will be adding in more information related to the Delta. The report will maintain the structure and attributes from 2011.

- Priority 1: Update existing indications with current data.
- Priority 2: Tweak indicators and benchmarks needing adjustment.
- Priority 3: Add new indicators.

The five Attributes that will organize the report are: [\(new items in blue\)](#)

Water Quality and Quantity- SFEI with the RMP are leading this piece.

Safe for aquatic life

Bay and [Delta](#)

Sidebars (i.e. not full indicator: [Nutrients and current-use pesticides](#))

Save to eat ([Delta](#), no new data for Bay)

Safe to swim (Bay and [Delta if data available](#))  
[Safe to drink](#) (new item)  
Freshwater inflow

### Habitat

Estuarine open water (Bay and [Delta](#))  
Baylands

Tidal March (Bay and [Delta](#))  
[Riparian?:](#) [Delta](#)

Watersheds (Bay and [Delta](#))

#### [Subtidal](#)

[Bay](#)

#### [Gulf of the Farallones](#)

[Dissolved oxygen\\*](#)

Developed by John Largier. We are realizing that we are more connected with the nearby ocean. Not for sure if this is going to happen

### Living Resources

Invertebrates (Bay and [Delta?](#))

Fish (Bay and [Delta](#))

Birds

[Bay \(adding shorebirds and Ridgway's rail\)](#) and [Delta](#)

[Mammals](#)

[Bay \(Harbor Seals\)](#)

### Ecological Processes

Flood events (Bay and [Delta](#))

Food Web (Bay and [Delta](#)) ([for Delta, nutrients/phytoplankton sidebar](#))

[Sediment supply\\*](#)

[Side bar \(not sure if can include the Delta\)](#)

[Climate Change\\*](#)

### Stewardship

Urban Water Use (Bay and [Delta](#))

Recycled Water (Bay and [Delta](#))

Coastal Cleanup (Bay and [Delta](#))

Public Access

[Bay](#)

Outside of the Attributes listed above, there are plans for the report's web presence. SFEI will be doing all of this work. Ideas in the pipeline include:

- Interactive storyline

- Summary video in lay terms

- Executive summary as interactive ebook

- Maybe a color wheel landing page linking to scorecard indicators, Estuaries Portal

- Links to PDFs of scorecard, executive summary main report, technical appendices.

As Judy mentioned earlier, there is new State Revolving Fund funding coming to support the report, and the scopes of work for the content are underway. The report development process includes roles for an Advisory Committee, Peer Review, and Project Leader.

Warner Chabot noted that journalists will write one story for any given event or press release. But for the State of the Estuary Conference, you could write dozens of stories. Can we develop and release some advance stories as a lead-up to the conference (i.e. every 3 days)? We should come up with an editorial strategy as well. Amy Hutzler stated that when the State of the Birds report came out, they had one key message: Birds aren't doing well, but where conservation is happening it helps the birds. We will need to define key messages.

### **Concluding Business**

#### **Review the Roadmap:**

Confirmed agenda items for the next meeting: CCMP, State of the Estuary Report, Conference Planning.

Other Items of interest: resilient shoreline, Plan Bay Area.

Tom Mumley reminded the Committee that as the year progresses we will have less time for topical update items because we will need more time for key SFEP items. Luisa Valiela suggested we add a discussion on drought, if it is timely. Maybe we should get a presentation on preparing for the next drought. Jane Lavelle suggested that for the August meeting we have a Prop 1 update and IRWMP round 3+.

#### **Announcements:**

Kate Poole let the Committee know about a new publication "*Wetter or Not*" by fifteen environmental groups showcasing a series of near-term drought actions and highlighting what can be done at the local level to make conservation a way of life and better manage stormwater. SFEP posted a copy on its homepage: <http://www.sfestuary.org>.

Rainer Hoenicke announced an upcoming Delta Stewardship Council Meeting on November 20<sup>th</sup>, to determine what was learned about the last 3 years of drought, with an overview on the drought and climate science by Dan Cayan (Scripps Institute).

The group bid goodbye to long-time member Peter LaCivita, who stated that it has been a pleasure to serve on this committee. Also thanked in absentia was Supervisor Susan Adams, who was not able to attend her last meeting as an IC representative. The IC took a group photo holding Thank You, Susan and Thank You, Peter signs to post to social media.

The meeting was adjourned, and the next meeting is Tuesday, March 3<sup>rd</sup>.

**Meeting Attendees:**

*IC Members*

Bill Brostoff, USACE  
Warner Chabot, SFEI  
Erin Chappell, DWR  
Josh Collins, SFEI  
Arthur Feinstein, Citizens Committee to  
Complete the Refuge  
Rainer Hoenicke, Delta Stewardship Council  
Amy Hutzell, State Coastal Conservancy  
Judy Kelly, San Francisco Estuary Partnership  
John Klochak, USFWS  
Jane Lavelle, SFPUC  
Peter LaCivita, USACE  
Carol Mahoney, Zone 7 Water Agency  
Jessica Martini-Lamb, Sonoma County Water  
Agency  
Tom Mumley, San Francisco Regional Water  
Board  
Kate Poole, NRDC  
Blake Roberts, Delta Protection Commission  
Barbara Salzman, Marin Audubon Society  
Korie Schaeffer, NOAA  
Harry Seraydarian, North Bay Watershed  
Association  
Melody Tovar, City of Sunnyvale  
Luisa Valiela, U.S. EPA

*Presenters*

Letitia Grenier, Consultant  
Ariel Rubissow Okamoto, Estuary News editor

*SFEP Staff*

Athena Honore  
Karen McDowell  
Jesse Mills  
James Muller  
Caitlin Sweeney  
Paula Trigueros